

City Council

Monday 20 November 2023

PRESENT:

Councillor Shayer, in the Chair.

Councillor Ms Watkin, Vice Chair.

Councillors Allen, Aspinall, Mrs Beer, Bingley, Blight, Briars-Delve, Mrs Bridgeman, Carlyle, Coker, Dr Cree, Cresswell, Dann, Dingle, Evans OBE, Finn, Gilmour, Goslin, Harrison, Haydon, Hendy, Holloway, Hulme, Krizanac, Loveridge, Lowry, Luggar, Dr Mahony, McLay, McNamara, Moore, Murphy, Nicholson, Noble, Partridge, Patel, Penberthy, Penrose, Poyser, Raynsford, Reilly, Rennie, Ricketts, Salmon, Smith, Sproston, Stephens, Stevens, Stoneman, Tippetts, Tofan, Tuffin, Tuohy and Wakeham.

Apologies for absence: Councillors Darcy and Laing

The meeting started at 14.03 and finished at 19.03.

Note: The full discussion can be viewed on the webcast of the City Council meeting at www.plymouth.gov.uk. At a future meeting, the Council will consider the accuracy of these draft minutes, so they may be subject to change. Please check the minutes of that meeting to confirm whether these minutes have been amended.

46. **Minutes**

The minutes of the meetings held on 18 September 2023 were agreed as a correct record.

47. **Declarations of Interest**

The following declarations of interest were made by councillors in accordance with the code of conduct in respect of items under consideration at the meeting -

Name	Item Number	Reason	Interest
Christopher Penberthy	11a	Pecuniary	Board Member of PEC Chemicals

48. **Appointments to Committees, Outside Bodies etc.**

There were no changes or appointments to committees, outside bodies etc. which required the consideration of Council.

49. **Questions by the Public**

The following question was submitted by Greg Black:

Question: Some residents in this city are on the cusp of being considered mentally competent to make decisions and care for themselves. Meaning these	Response: We understand that it is a worrying time for families and individuals when a loved one appears to become unwell or seem unable to make
--	---

<p>people are very vulnerable and at risk or harm or self neglect. How does the council support these people and what support is there for them?</p>	<p>decisions for themselves. This can be caused by many factors, including their physical or mental health. It can mean they struggle to make decisions about their health or care needs, or their finances. We know that having the capacity to make decisions is not fixed and for some people does change and fluctuate depending on how well they are at the time.</p> <p>The Mental Capacity Act 2005 (known as the MCA) is the legislation that sets out how we should approach assessments in these circumstances. The MCA starts with the assumption that people have the capacity to make decisions for themselves and sets out the process when there is a need to challenge that fundamental assumption. There are a range of health and social care professionals that carry out Mental Capacity Act Assessments (MCA). These are grounded in our best understanding of people’s needs and wishes. Often people are supported by family and friends through this process.</p> <p>We do also have support for people who are going through this process via advocacy services like those provided by the Highbury Trust. We have support for the family or friends of the person via our carer’s services, which are provided by Improving Lives Plymouth and also support and advice available from other VCSE partners including Age UK.</p>
<p>The following question was submitted by Chaz Singh:</p>	
<p>Question: After the horrific fire at Luton Airport have PCC carried out their own fire and risk assessments for their multi storey and ground level car parks owned by them. Can you provide these and when they were carried out?</p>	<p>Response: Thank you for your question.</p> <p>All Council car parks are subject to risk assessments. These risk assessments review a wide range of risks and hazards alongside the measures that are in place to mitigate risk, for the purpose of helping</p>

	<p>to keep people safe. Risks assessments are reviewed at least annually, and additionally upon any occasion that a car park may be subject to a change or where we may have had a report of a near miss or accident.</p> <p>These risks assessments include checks such as the operation of fire doors and that access and egress routes are clear.</p> <p>Risk assessments can be updated at any time where, at the time of writing, the last risk assessment was reviewed and updated on 21st October 2023. We can provide you access to any of the car park risk assessments that you would like to see.</p>
<p>The following question was submitted by Saranjit Kaur:</p>	
<p>Question: Can the council confirm who will pay any additional costs if there is an increase to the amended plans for Armada Way after the consultation by ECF and when detailed scale plans will be available?</p>	<p>Response: Thank you for your question. Once the design for Armada Way scheme is agreed, following consideration of the response to the consultation, the City Council will evaluate the overall financial impact and determine the best sources of funding to enable the scheme to proceed.</p> <p>In relation to the provision of scaled plans, considerable detail is already set out in the plan and supporting documents that form part of the current consultation.</p>
<p>The following question was submitted by Grace Strickland</p>	
<p>Question: Electric vehicles bring additional safety concerns in relation to Plymouth's Multi Storey Car Parks. Can the council advise if any surveys have been undertaken including, new fire risks and other associated risk assessments regarding electric vehicles using the car parks to reassure residents the car parks are safe to use?</p>	<p>Response: Thank you for your question.</p> <p>Whilst we understand there has been some focus of attention on electric vehicles following the tragic fire at Luton airport, it is worth pointing out that this fire started with a diesel-powered vehicle, which Bedfordshire's Chief Fire Officer then advised 'quickly and rapidly spread'.</p>

	<p>There is a range of new and emerging guidance coming out in relation to car park design and fire safety guidance for electric vehicles, and Plymouth City Council will review all this information as it becomes available and consider how this can help inform how we deliver such services.</p> <p>All of our car parks are subject to regular risk assessments which, in the case of fire safety, include looking at areas such as ensuring pedestrian routes remain clear and fire doors are routinely inspected. Following the Luton car park incident, we have had further inspections by the Fire Brigade, all helping to ensure we can continue to provide safe parking.</p>
<p>The following question was submitted by Kevin Treweeks.</p>	
<p>Question: Given the appalling collective punishment being inflicted on the people of Gaza by the Israeli military and the complicity in this by western arms industries facilitated by Barclays Bank. Will Council take a stand for peace and divest from Barclays before the Government removes its discretion to take ethical decision?</p>	<p>Response: Thank you, Mr Treweeks, for your question and we are very mindful of the situation.</p> <p>In terms of the practical question of PCC's relationship with Barclays Bank. I would like to assure you we do not hold investments with the bank. We do use Barclays for our day-to-day banking requirements, but this does not extend to direct investments.</p> <p>The banking sector, available to large organisations such as this authority, is very narrow given our need to protect taxpayers' money.</p> <p>We have limited divestment options as Barclays mainly provides day to day banking under a previously agreed contract and we hold no long-term investments with Barclays. Short term investment through use of a Barclays Premium Account is used to manage our immediate liquidity to cover any ad hoc emergency or one-off payment and this account is generally limited to <£1m. We are always mindful of our</p>

	<p>need to ensure the Councils approach to the delivery of services is an ethical one and this will of course continue to be the case.</p>
<p>The following question was submitted by George Wheeler:</p>	
<p>Question: My question is about three bus shelter sites in-bound on Victoria Road, St Budeaux. The DeCaux shelters at Row Lane and Verna Road have been removed. When will Clear Channel replace them and can you say why the Clear Channel shelter at Evelyn Street has no seating, please?</p>	<p>Response: The Row Lane bus shelter will not be replaced with a Clear Channel shelter but has instead been replaced with a bus stop pole and flag.</p> <p>The shelter to the north of the Verna Road junction is currently programmed for replacement in February 2024. We are aware that the old shelter was removed in October, and the team are therefore working with Clear Channel to see if installation of the new shelter can be brought forward in the programme, although this cannot be guaranteed at this stage.</p> <p>The inbound shelter to the north of Evelyn Street has not yet been replaced and the original JCDecaux shelter is still in situ. The seating had to be removed as a result of vandalism, to prevent injury to users of the shelter. Given the JCDecaux contract had ended, replacement seating was not an option in the old shelter. There are currently no dates programmed for either the removal of the old shelter or installation of the new one, but when the new one goes in, bench style seating will be provided at this location.</p>
<p>The following question was submitted by Dave Cann:</p>	
<p>Question: In Peverell two Street signs have been removed one in Meredith Road the other Beauchamp crescent both streets off outland road. Can someone clarify if this is temporary or permanent?</p>	<p>Response: Beauchamp Road – street sign was removed the week of 20th July 2022. The sign was on the left-hand side as you look into Beauchamp Road from Outland Road. Due to the flow of traffic, a sign was required on the right-hand side rather than the left-hand side, a new sign was made up and put on the railings instead.</p> <p>The Meredith Road street-sign was</p>

	<p>removed the week of 5th June 2023. It was reported as broken so naturally removed for safety reasons. There is a 'Meredith Road' street sign on the opposite side, which is more visible to traffic approaching from Elphinstone Road via Montpelier Road. The City Council's protocol is to ensure at least one street nameplate exists at a junction that is not part of the major network. Neighbouring streets, Belair Road and Onslow Road each have a single street nameplate at their junctions with Elphinstone Road.</p>
--	--

50. **Announcements**

Councillor Mark Shayer (The Lord Mayor of Plymouth) made the following announcements:

- a) Reported with sadness the passing of the former Lord Mayor and former Labour Councillor, Alderman Michael Wright, who passed away on Saturday 28 October 2023. Alderman Michael Wright served as a Councillor for 18 years and called for one minute of silence in remembrance.
- b) Reported with sadness the untimely death of Carol Blackburn (A.K.A Carol Toms) and called for one minute of silence in remembrance. Carol Blackburn was a past Councillor for the St Budeaux ward of the city and served on the Council between 2000-2006.
- c) Congratulated City College Plymouth. The institution had been awarded the prestigious Queen's Anniversary Prize; recognised as the highest national honour in the sector, the Queen's Anniversary Prizes are part of the UK's national Honours system, acknowledging the outstanding work of UK colleges and universities which show excellence, innovation and the delivery of real benefits to the wider world.
- d) Congratulated apprentice Molly Blagden, who had been crowned Level 2 Autocare Apprentice of the Year by Exeter College.
- e) Congratulated Social Worker Charlie Mason who had won the Silver Award in the Team Leader of the Year, Adult Services category of Social Worker of the Year Awards award in recognition of her extraordinary practice and leadership.
- f) Announced that The Platinum Parkway (Forder Valley Link Road) had been named 'New Build Project of the Year' in the 'over £8m' category of 2023's Institute of Civil Engineering South-West Civil Engineering Awards, which recognised outstanding achievement, innovation, and ingenuity.

Councillor Tudor Evans OBE (The Leader of the Council) made the following announcements:

- g) A letter had been received provisionally awarding £19 946 417 in 'Levelling- Up "3" funding'. The funds would be allocated towards marine innovation, including "innovation barns" and "Ocean's Gate" projects as well as the modernisation of port infrastructure at Millbay. This would include a move towards 'shore power' with the aim for the PCC to attain 'net zero' carbon emissions by 2026 instead of 2030. This money would need to be spent by 2026 and would enable greater access for jobs and raise the aspirations of young people to enter into marine employment.
- h) During the week commencing 12th November 2023, a £7.5 Million bid had been won for Innovate UK's "national innovation launchpad" through a partnership of Plymouth City Council, Plymouth University and the Freeport.
- i) The Economic Development team, working with Plymouth University, had organised, and had successfully convened, the "FLOW Conference"- Plymouth's first ever offshore floating wind conference on 30th October. This builds on the work Plymouth City Council had conducting on the city's port strategy to make Plymouth a centre for decarbonisation.
- j) The National Heritage Fund Lottery 'round two visit' had taken place during the week commencing 12th November 2023. Further funds would be applied for in the future on the advice of the aforementioned Lottery.
- k) A deal with "Live Nation", The UKs biggest outdoor live music promoter, had been brokered for a four-day music festival on the hoe in 2024. There is a strong potential this would be extended for four further years and then a subsequent five years.
- l) Destination Plymouth had produced the following statistics: *"In 2023 we have so far reached a global audience of 2.5bn valued at an advertising value of £62m. This compares to 650m audience and £18m advertising value in 2022."*
- m) The Box has had 660,000 Visitors since its opening until a recent date, which was far ahead of target, as well as 11,000 during half term; a 20% increase on last year's figures.
- n) The Box had hosted a summer programme celebrating Sir Joshua Reynolds which had included a new film by John Akomfrah as well as the return of Westward Television Mascot 'Gus Honeybun' accompanied by comedians Joshua Widdicombe and Nish Kumar. A public arts installation at the Civic Centre by Sir Ben Okri OBE had also been organised by Plymouth Culture and taken place.

Councillor Tom Briars-Delve (Cabinet Member for Environment and Climate Change) made the following announcements:

- o) A 'Seasonal Update' was given; Winter vegetation cutbacks had started earlier than usual. 'Sweep vehicles' had covered 10,346 miles since the start of September and 609 tonnes of swept waste, primarily leaves, had been removed from Streets and Highways. These would be Regularly attending the 41 flood spots most likely to flood and would be included in Highways updates in order to respond proactively to forecast heavy rain.

- p) Immanuel Marshall had been working to complete the second cohort of Carbon Literacy Training for Councillors. A third cohort of training was scheduled for the 11th and 18th of January 2024.
- q) PCC had planted over 6,000 trees during 2023 as part of the Plymouth and South Devon Community Forest project.
- r) Councillors had now been contacted regarding the 30 new tree planting schemes for Winter 2023/34. Over 350 'standards', over 50 'Maidens' and 3500 'Whips' sized trees were intending to be planted.

Councillor Sue Dann (Cabinet Member for Customer Services, Sport, Leisure and HR & OD) made the following announcements:

- s) A 'Cost of Living update' was offered; whilst inflation had reduced the 'Overall Cost of Living' had not and the Councillor appreciated that many households were struggling.
- t) £4.5 million from the DWP had been distributed to low-income households and the Community Connections Team had been working with households and employers.
- u) 'Warm Spaces Hubs' had been launched the week commencing 12th November 2023.
- v) Confirmed that the incumbent administration would be continuing to promote "Cost of Living hubs" across the City.
- w) Councillor Chris Penberthy (Cabinet Member for Housing, Cooperative Development and Communities) made the following announcement:
- x) Thanked Councillor Pauline Murphy and Babcock International for assistance with Remembrance Day commemorations, which had included a display of waterproof poppies outside the Council House.

Councillor Sally Haydon (Cabinet Member for Community Safety, Libraries, Cemeteries and Crematoria) made the following announcements:

- y) The "Donate a Coat" scheme would be in effect during winter 2023/2024 at Local Libraries.
- z) After having taken onboard recent feedback, the sale of stationary in libraries would now be in effect.
- aa) Announced the activities taking place as part of a 'Plymouth Says Enough' (combating violence against women) campaign including a march, the illumination of various buildings in the colour orange, which represents the organisation, the launch of a website offering help and support in reference to as well as further information available on the Plymouth City Council's website.

Councillor Sarah Allen (Chair of Audit and Governance Committee) made the following announcement:

- bb) Following next May's local elections, the Local Government Boundary Commission for England would be conducting a review of Plymouth's wards, ward boundaries and the number of Councillors comprising the City Council.
- cc) The Council had until June 2024 to inform the Local Government Boundary Commission for England if it intends to retain elections by thirds, which could affect Wards which currently had two rather than three elected members during the electoral review.
- dd) Officers had met with colleagues from Southampton City Council on several occasions to learn from Southampton's recent experience of an electoral review, and would draft proposals on electoral consultation arrangements for consideration by the Audit and Governance Committee to fit with the electoral review timetable.

Councillor Mary Aspinall (Cabinet Member for Health and Adult Social Care) made the following announcements:

- ee) The National Safeguarding Adult Week would be running during the 20th to the 26th November 2023, the aim would be to highlight key safeguarding issues, hold informative conversations and to raise awareness of adult safeguarding issues around the City. During this week representatives from the council, adults safeguarding teams and adult safeguarding partnerships would be spending time in several of the city's health and well-being hubs raising awareness, listening to people's experiences and sign posting residents to assistance programmes.
- ff) Several pharmacy closures had been causing stress and worry for residents. The Councillor had been in conversation with Devon Local Pharmaceutical Committee regarding the situation and concerns. The Health and Wellbeing Board had completed a pharmacy needs assessment in 2022, however the closures would impact that report. The Councillor had discussed the situation with the chair of Health and Adults Social Care Scrutiny and confirmed that the committee had considered initial reports on the 13th December 2023 which would be fed into the January 2024 Health and Wellbeing Board. Cllr Aspinall asked to be kept informed of any further closures and their impact on Councillors' wards and would update Council as soon as she would able.

Councillor Aspinall left the meeting at 14.56.

51. **Capital Monitoring Report**

The report was introduced by Councillor Lowry (Cabinet Member for Finance) and seconded by Councillor Evans (The Leader of the Council).

Following contributions from Councillors Luggier, Briars-Delve, Noble, Nicholson the Council agreed to:

- I. Approve the Capital Monitoring Report.

For (49)

Councillors Allen, Mrs Beer, Bingley, Blight, Briars-Delve, Mrs Bridgeman, Carlyle, Coker, Cresswell, Dann, Dingle, Evans OBE, Gilmour, Goslin, Harrison, Haydon, Hendy, Holloway, Hulme, Krizanac, Loveridge, Lowry, Lugger, Dr Mahony, McLay, McNamara, Moore, Murphy, Nicholson, Noble, Partridge, Patel, Penberthy, Penrose, Poyser, Raynsford, Reilly, Rennie, Ricketts, Salmon, Smith, Sproston, Stephens, Stevens, Stoneman, Tippetts, Tuffin, Tuohy, Wakeham and Watkin.

Abstain (1)
Councillor Ricketts

Against (0)

Absent/Did Not Vote (5)
Councillors Aspinall, Dr Cree, Finn, Tofan and Shayer.

Councillors Finn and Tofan left the meeting at 14:54 and returned at 15:07.

52. **Withdrawal from the Heart of the South West Joint Committee**

The withdrawal notice was introduced by Councillor Evans OBE (The Leader of the Council) and seconded by Councillor Lowry (Cabinet Member for Finance).

Following one contribution from Councillor Lugger, the Council agreed to:

1) Withdraw from the Committee.

For (52)
Councillors Allen, Mrs Beer, Bingley, Blight, Briars-Delve, Mrs Bridgeman, Carlyle, Coker, Cresswell, Dann, Dingle, Evans OBE, Finn, Gilmour, Goslin, Harrison, Haydon, Hendy, Holloway, Hulme, Krizanac, Loveridge, Lowry, Lugger, Dr Mahony, McLay, McNamara, Moore, Murphy, Nicholson, Noble, Partridge, Patel, Penberthy, Penrose, Poyser, Raynsford, Reilly, Rennie, Ricketts, Salmon, Smith, Sproston, Stephens, Stevens, Stoneman, Tippetts, Tofan, Tuffin, Tuohy, Wakeham and Watkin.

Abstain (0)

Against (0)

Absent/Did Not Vote (3)
Councillors Aspinall, Dr Cree and Shayer.

53. **Violence Against Women and Girls**

The report was introduced by Councillor Sally Haydon (Cabinet Member for Community Safety, Libraries, Cemeteries and Crematoria) and seconded by Councillor Reilly (Chair of Education and Children's Social Care Overview and Scrutiny Committee).

Following a contribution from Councillors Smith, Harrison, McLay, Loveridge, Poyser and Beer the Council agreed to:

I. Continue to endorse the City-wide 'Strategy and Action Plan'.

For (52)

Councillors Allen, Mrs Beer, Bingley, Blight, Briars-Delve, Mrs Bridgeman, Carlyle, Coker, Cresswell, Dann, Dingle, Evans OBE, Finn, Gilmour, Goslin, Harrison, Haydon, Hendy, Holloway, Hulme, Krizanac, Loveridge, Lowry, Lugger, Dr Mahony, McLay, McNamara, Moore, Murphy, Nicholson, Noble, Partridge, Patel, Penberthy, Penrose, Poyser, Raynsford, Reilly, Rennie, Ricketts, Salmon, Smith, Sproston, Stephens, Stevens, Stoneman, Tippetts, Tofan, Tuffin, Tuohy, Wakeham and Watkin.

Abstain (0) Councillors

Against (0) Councillors

Absent/Did Not Vote (3)

Councillors Aspinall, Dr Cree and Shayer.

54. **Full Council Dates**

The report was introduced by Councillor Evans OBE (The Leader of the Council) and seconded by Councillor Sue Dann (Cabinet Member for Customer Services, Sport, Leisure & HR, and OD).

Council agreed to:

I. Approve the provisional Full Council Dates for 2024.

For (52)

Councillors Allen, Mrs Beer, Bingley, Blight, Briars-Delve, Mrs Bridgeman, Carlyle, Coker, Cresswell, Dann, Dingle, Evans OBE, Finn, Gilmour, Goslin, Harrison, Haydon, Hendy, Holloway, Hulme, Krizanac, Loveridge, Lowry, Lugger, Dr Mahony, McLay, McNamara, Moore, Murphy, Nicholson, Noble, Partridge, Patel, Penberthy, Penrose, Poyser, Raynsford, Reilly, Rennie, Ricketts, Salmon, Smith, Sproston, Stephens, Stevens, Stoneman, Tippetts, Tofan, Tuffin, Tuohy, Wakeham and Watkin.

Abstain (0)

Against (0)

Absent/Did Not Vote (3)

Councillors Aspinall, Dr Cree and Shayer.

Following the vote, Council adjourned for a period of 30 minutes.

55. **Motions on notice**

56. **COP28 Climate and Ecology**

The motion was introduced by Councillor Briars-Delve (Cabinet Member for Environment and Climate Change) and seconded by Councillor Moore.

Councillor Stoneman proposed an amendment, which was seconded by Lee Finn. The amendment pertained to the wording of the motion, specifying the inclusion of a reference to the policies of the incumbent Westminster Administration.

After contributions from Councillor Briars-Delve and Councillor Finn, the amendment was not passed.

Following a discussion with contributions from Councillors Nicholson, Stoneman, Smith, Krizanac, Holloway, McLay, Cresswell and Lee, Council agreed to:

1. Express disappointment that the Government has reversed key environmental commitments and did not use the King's Speech to present urgent environmental legislation such as the Climate and Ecology Bill;
2. Request the Leader to write to Plymouth's Members of Parliament, urging them to support the aforementioned calls of the Climate APPG before COP28;
3. Commit to tackling the climate and ecological emergencies locally by developing an updated Net Zero Action Plan with additional decarbonisation commitments, and a new ambitious Plan for Nature Recovery for Cabinet approval and Council endorsement.

For (35)

Councillors Allen, Mrs Beer, Blight, Briars-Delve, Mrs Bridgeman, Coker, Cresswell, Dann, Dingle, Evans OBE, Gilmour, Goslin, Haydon, Hendy, Holloway, Hulme, Krizanac, Lowry, McLay, McNamara, Moore, Murphy, Nicholson, Noble, Penrose, Poyser, Raynsford, Reilly, Rennie, Sproston, Stephens, Stevens, Tippetts, Tuffin and Tuohy.

Abstain (16)

Councillors Bingley, Carlyle, Finn, Harrison, Luggier, Loveridge, Dr Mahony, Partridge, Patel, Ricketts, Salmon, Smith, Stoneman, Tofan, Wakeham and Ms Watkin.

Against (0) Councillors

Absent/Did Not Vote (4)

Councillors Aspinall, Dr Cree, Penberthy and Shayer.

57. **Improved Public Connectivity with Plymouth City Council**

The motion was introduced by Councillor Salmon and seconded by Councillor Luggier.

Following a discussion with contributions from Councillors Haydon, Penberthy, Nicholson & Dann, Councillor Dann proposed an amendment, seconded by Councillor Haydon. This amendment proposed the referral of the motion to the relevant scrutiny committee.

Councillor Dann additionally proposed a secondary amendment, seconded by Councillor Haydon to move to the closure of the vote.

Following these two amendments, and conjecture from members of the chamber including Councillors Luggier, Penberthy and Dann to the clarity of the votes taking place in reference to the original motion and two amendments having been put forward, the meeting was adjourned for five minutes.

Following the vote regarding the closure motion, the amendment was passed.

The amendment to refer the motion to scrutiny was passed.

After summation by Councillor David Salmon, the council agreed to the amended motion to:

- I. Refer the motion to the relevant scrutiny committee.

For (48)

Councillors Allen, Mrs Beer, Bingley, Blight, Briars-Delve, Mrs Bridgeman, Carlyle, Coker, Cresswell, Dann, Evans OBE, Finn, Gilmour, Goslin, Haydon, Hendy, Hulme, Krizanac, Loveridge, Lowry, Lugger, Dr Mahony, McLay, McNamara, Moore, Murphy, Nicholson, Noble, Patel, Penberthy, Penrose, Poyser, Raynsford, Reilly, Rennie, Ricketts, Salmon, Smith, Sproston, Stephens, Stevens, Stoneman, Tippetts, Tofan, Tuffin, Tuohy, Wakeham and Watkin.

Abstain (0) Councillors

Against (0) Councillors

Absent/Did Not Vote (7)

Councillors Aspinall, Dr Cree, Dingle, Harrison, Holloway, Partridge, and Shayer.

Councillors Holloway, Dingle and Partridge Left the meeting at the conclusion of this Motion on Notice.

58. **Transparency of Councillors Casework to the public**

The motion was introduced by Councillor Stephen Hulme and seconded by Councillor Mrs Terri Beer.

Following a discussion with contributions from Councillors Dann and Penberthy Council, the motion was not passed.

For (4) Councillors Mrs. Beer, Mrs. Bridgeman, Hulme, Nicholson.

Abstain (0) Councillors

Against (45) Councillors

Councillors Allen, Bingley, Blight, Briars-Delve, Carlyle, Coker, Cresswell, Dann, Evans OBE, Finn, Gilmour, Goslin, Haydon, Harrison, Hendy, Krizanac, Loveridge, Lowry, Lugger, Dr Mahony, McLay, McNamara, Moore, Murphy, Noble, Patel, Penberthy, Penrose, Poyser, Raynsford, Reilly, Rennie, Ricketts, Salmon, Smith, Sproston, Stephens, Stevens, Stoneman, Tippetts, Tofan, Tuffin, Tuohy, Wakeham and Watkin.

Absent/Did Not Vote (6)

Councillors Aspinall, Dr Cree, Dingle, Holloway, Partridge, and Shayer.

59. **Questions by Councillors**

#	From	To	Subject
1	Cllr Stoneman	Cllr Coker	Should the Council be supporting infrastructure around schools enabling pupils and students to walk to school?
			Response: Yes.
			Supplementary: Would Councillor Coker meet with Councillor Stoneman to discuss areas of the city that have expressed concerns?
			Response: Yes.
2	Cllr Harrison	Cllr Briars-Delve	There had been lots of complaints received regarding bins damaged by council staff. Was there a mechanism to ensure residents are not expected to pay £25 for a replacement or for one to be fixed?
			Response: Yes, this could be flagged online or through Councillor's Casework. Damaged public bins are also available to be flagged in this manner and have a unique numerical identifier.
3	Cllr Rennie	Cllr Haydon	There are large numbers of take away drivers in private cars who are not insured or licenced in the correct way. Are you aware that this is the case and that drivers require correct insurance to undertake this job?
			Response: Yes. I am aware of this. Drivers require a specific type of insurance referred to as "carriage of good insurance". If drivers do not have this insurance, they would be liable. Enforcement of this would fall under a police matter. Furthermore, this is an issue that will be debated in commons.
			Supplementary: Would there be any beneficial quality to speak with relevant authorities in parliament or the Department for Transport to further knowledge and regulation of this matter, specifically when a licensing application is made?
			Response: Yes, there would be, and Councillor Rennie would be included in future conversations.
4	Cllr Stephens	Cllr Cresswell	This authority has been challenged to meet the needs of Children with additional health, education, or disability needs. Despite these additional needs, most children would not need to be educated in a special needs school.
			Besides the added Capital and Transportation costs, children with special needs deserve to be educated within their community to develop a sense of belonging and forge friendships. What actions could be enacted to make this happen within our community?
Response: Issues around Children with SEND (Special Needs and Disabilities) and SEND sufficiency is something that is currently being developed within a comprehensive plan. Key, as well, is the issue of early			

	<p>intervention- early identification has been a key part of Labour's improvement planning and ensures children can be maintained in mainstream schools.</p> <p>A cultural shift would also be required, which would allow for greater community inclusion and to inspire confidence teachers and support staff to be able to work effectively with SEND children within mainstream schooling. This would require services, resources and training and would inspire confidence in parents and carers, putting less pressure on the seeking of EHCPs (Education, Health and Care Plan) and places in special schools.</p> <p>Finally, this has been incorporated as part of SEND sufficiency planning, taking advantage of any fall in primary roles, using things like pods or specialist provisions within existing mainstream schools. This does bring inclusion to the heart of the community.</p> <p>All these options were being explored. It is important to be thinking as broadly as possible as not having a plan is very costly in the long run.</p>	
	<p>Supplementary: In light of the recent OFSTED inspection of SEND in this city what actions have taken place to share accountability between the city, the local authority, schools, governors and multi-academy trusts and trustees?</p>	
	<p>Response: The current administration have a SEND improvement Plan, a SEND improvement board and would continue to develop the already existing openness and transparency on all issues related to SEND. Cross-party co-operation would continue to transpire in Scrutiny and within political commitments and the SEND improvement board.</p>	
5	<p>Cllr Hulme</p>	<p>Cllr Penberthy</p> <p>As you are responsible for the Street Naming, and therefore the proposal, to rename Sir John Hawkins square, could you inform the council what other options were ruled out from this process?</p>
	<p>Response: No options were ruled out as the process was followed correctly. Any ward councillor could put forward name change requests for any street or place. Now that one has been made, we would await contributions by members of the public in response to this.</p>	
	<p>Supplementary: Why was consultation not put out to the public in March 2022 by the then Leader of the Council?</p>	
	<p>Response: Whilst it would not be for Councillor Penberthy to answer for the previous administration, this current administration has followed the council's policy. This policy has remained within both the legislation as well as the standards of good practice issued by national government.</p>	
6	<p>Cllr Beer</p>	<p>Cllr Dann</p> <p>Gambling is addiction and affects a huge amount of people. Does the PCC have a policy in HR to cover this addiction?</p>
	<p>Response: Not specifically. There is a general information guide to support addiction as well as specific pages for Alcohol and Drug addictions. Occupational Health would usually be contacted as well encouraging citizens to work with Citizen's Advice Bureau.</p>	

	<p>As part of the Cost-of-Living Action Plan, the current administration would be looking at, during the Christmas period, the dissemination of messages about gambling addiction in addition to other addictions and would be highlighting the support offered throughout the city and online. Finally, there is an NHS Website called “Qwell” which has mentoring support.</p>		
	<p>Supp: Could you ensure the links are provided online on all our websites to gambling addiction support sites?</p>		
	<p>Response: Yes, it would be checked.</p>		
7	Cllr Dr Mahony	Cllr Evans (OBE)	<p>The reprovisioning of the Mayflower Medical Group has taken place and there will be new administration and delivery of this next May. Was it that the Leader or any members possessed pre-knowledge or were involved in any input into this process?</p>
	<p>Response: The Leader was not aware, however Councillor Aspinall, the portfolio holder, would respond when available.</p>		
	<p>Supplementary: Do you believe it were relevant for us to have had a briefing from the NHS and do you think whether this has been managed satisfactorily by One Devon and the NHS?</p>		
	<p>Response: A conversation would be had with the Portfolio Holder and a response would be issued.</p>		
8	Cllr Luggier	Cllr Allen	<p>On 21 November 2022, the Council voted for public consultation on the subject of moving the electoral cycle from 1/3rds to “all-out” elections.</p> <p>Could it be explained as to why this consultation did not take place immediately when Council asked for it to be, who has had it brought back for discussions from Southampton, and why was this not brought back to full council for discussion?</p>
	<p>Response: Councillor Luggier was referred you back to Councillor Allen’s announcement; under the scheme of delegation, this issue was reverted back to the Audit and Governance Committee.</p>		
	<p>Supplementary: would this be an attempt by the current administration to keep the status quo as far as the Electoral Cycle is concerned without consulting the people?</p>		
	<p>Response: Full Council delegated the issue back to Audit and Governance Committee. Therefore, the Audit and Governance committee would carry out the request of full council.</p>		
9	Cllr Wakeham	Cllr Briars-Delve	<p>The SUDs (Sustainable Urban Drainage) scheme project was due to be finished in July. It is As of this meeting, it is nowhere near completion. As winter would be coming, conditions would become increasingly wet and boggy. What would be the completion date and what was the delay?</p>
	<p>Response: Councillor Wakeham has referred to the Central Park SUDs scheme.</p> <p>The scheduling for this programme was altered a long time ago. The aim</p>		

	<p>was for the majority of the works to be completed before Christmas. There are aspects of the scheme that can't be done, or wouldn't make financial sense to be done, during the winter such as some of the landscaping works but the bulk of the works would be done by December and would be working to budget.</p>		
	<p>Supplementary: The work would have taken twice as long as estimated to complete. Does this mean it would have cost twice the amount?</p>		
	<p>Response: Financial projections would not be based on odd predictions and ratios. The current administration would be working to the budget to which the officers have been instructed and it has been assured that, at the moment, this would remain the case.</p>		
10	Cllr McLay	Cllr Dann	<p>In light of the Cost-of-Living Crisis, would any festive-specific guidance or signposting be issued by Plymouth City Council, ranging from bin-collections and the recycling of Christmas trees to mental health and domestic abuse support?</p>
	<p>Response: From a cost-of-living perspective, there would be communications released regarding free events during the period and guidance around managing a budget and thriftiness. Warm Spaces hubs were being rolled out and these local community-based organisations were sharing advice from the Citizen's Advice Bureau as well as operating as a network for citizens. The proceeding six weeks would be focussed on what support could be offered to households struggling in the lead up to Christmas.</p>		
11	Cllr Tuffin	Cllr Penberthy	<p>Could you provide an update on the current situation with regard to the condition of the Tidal Pool at Firestone Bay?</p>
	<p>Response: This administration has allocated £150,000 from the Capital programme to repair the pool in Early 2024. The structural Integrity of the pool would be strengthened using techniques for the repair of marine structures. A combination of pre-formed and reinforced concrete with marine grade stainless steel reinforcement would ensure that the pool is fit for years to come. The environmental implications would be reviewed and a construction Environmental Management plan produced prior to the commencement of any work on site. The works would not duplicate anything in the National Marine Park program but would complement it in terms of work being done elsewhere at Devil's Point.</p>		
	<p>Supplementary: Could Councillor Penberthy provide some additional information about any other projects that would be occurring in that area of Plymouth in reference to the tidal pool?</p>		
	<p>Response: Some essential upgrades would be needed immediately around the tidal pool. The jetty, which is one of the supporting walls to the pool and where there has been a sea breach, would be looked into. The steps are to be repaired and the railings replaced. Lockers would be installed for swimmers and the improvement of signage on safety and usage of that part of the bay would be investigated. In relation to what local communities have been saying- any budget remaining would be spent improving seating. Works would begin in March 2024 and would take approximately 10 weeks.</p>		
12	Cllr	Cllr	<p>On the 19th of June Council debated a motion</p>

	Nicholson	Bingley	<p>in relation to fixing Plymouth's roads. During the debate, an amendment was moved in which the Growth and Infrastructure Scrutiny Committee were requested to review the effectiveness of the current procedures for maintaining the City's roads and pavements. Despite three sittings of the committee, this has not appeared in the work programme. Given the announcement of £1.4 Million for Plymouth roads very recently could it be ensured that this is placed into the work programme and would be given urgent consideration?</p>
	<p>Response: Councillor Bingley issued apologies that this was not done; the committee were awaiting the confirmation of the aforementioned funding. Given that, as of the day of this sitting, Councillor Bingley was more certain about where the Scrutiny Committee were in terms of central government funding, it would be put into the work programme.</p>		
	<p>Supplementary: Was the Councillor prepared to hold additional meetings of the scrutiny panel to ensure that the important business would be activated and that recommendations were made to the Cabinet Member?</p>		
	<p>Response: Councillor Bingley was currently appointed as the chair and would be working within a team. This would be raised at the next committee and, according to their agreement, this would be done.</p>		
13	Cllr Smith	Cllr Briars-Delve	<p>The contract for the processing of garden waste is would be up for re-tendering during the time of this sitting. When would that process start, how close to home would the Council prefer the processing to take place and what would the target be for emissions?</p>
	<p>Response: Councillor Briars-Delve would investigate and get back Councillor Smith.</p>		
14	Cllr Loveridge	Cllr Coker	<p>What would be the overall strategy for improving traffic FL traffic flow and keeping our residents safe in the community?</p>
			<p>Response: The question was broad-based and could not be answered sufficiently in this meeting. The council has had a long-term local transport plan which is up for renewal. This information would be available on the website but if there are any more specific questions Councillor Coker would be contactable.</p>
15	Cllr Bingley	Cllr Coker	<p>In terms of community and passenger safety, what would the coverage for CCTV at bus shelters be and could the City be provided with clear bus shelters, as opposed to opaque ones? When would the council be able to have these delivered by the contractor?</p>
	<p>Response: The new shelters are clearer and help with visibility. The long-term aspiration would be to investigate areas of particular concern and to</p>		

	provide funding for CCTV in these areas. The focus would be on adding CCTV to certain areas. Not every shelter would have CCTV installed as the budget would not allow this, but the current administration would be undertaking a strategic approach to the installation of these. The process of installations under the previous administration's contract would need to be actioned first. From a transport perspective, the focus is to "do more", however currently there is a requirement to complete the installation of camera and bus stops outlined by the previous administration.		
16	Cllr Tippetts	Cllr Coker	The printed timetabling by Stagecoach on Route 31 is too small, elderly people have struggled to read these. Could you liaise with Stagecoach to rectify this?
	Response: Councillor Coker was unaware of this and would commit to speaking with Stagecoach. Peverell and Compton wards were working hard to promote Route 31, however its continued operation would require the assistance by Ward Councillors to promote it.		
17	Cllr Mahony	Cllr Dann	Could you speak to the conflict in casework: are we meant to be referring cases directly to Officers?
	Response: Most work should go through casework, however sometimes, if a piece of casework were to be particularly complex or time sensitive such as safeguarding or police matters, it would be prudent to contact an Officer or Manager directly. A sensible approach would be required.		
	Supplementary: Would it be possible for the original cases or phone numbers for officers to be attached?		
	Response: Casework is an imperfect system, however it should be used as the cases are then able to be tracked. A trial is currently being undertaken to identify ways in which casework could be improved. Budget cuts had affected three Business Support positions, which has impacted response times.		

Please note that questions, answers, supplementary questions and supplementary answers have been summarised.